

**Theory of Computation, CSCI 438 spring 2022**  
**Pumping lemma for context-free languages, pages 123- 127, March 2**

1. Prove that  $L = \{a^n b^n c^n \mid n \geq 0\}$  is not context-free. (This is example 2.36, page 126, in the text.)

Proof: Suppose, by way of contradiction, that  $L$  is context-free. Then the pumping lemma must hold for  $L$ . Let  $p$  be the pumping length. Consider the string  $s = a^p b^p c^p$ . Clearly  $s \in L$  and  $|s| \geq p$ . The pumping lemma guarantees that  $s$  can be divided into five pieces  $s = uvxyz$  where  $|vxy| \leq p$ ,  $|vy| > 0$  and  $s_i = uv^i xy^i z \in L$  for all  $i \geq 0$ . Consider all possible breakdowns  $s = uvxyz$  where  $|vxy| \leq p$ ,  $|vy| > 0$ .

Case 1:  $vxy$  occurs entirely in the  $a$ 's,  $b$ 's or the  $c$ 's.

Case 2:  $vxy$  occurs within the  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's.

Case 3:  $vxy$  occurs within the  $b$ 's and  $c$ 's.

Consider each case separately.

Case 1:  $vxy$  occurs entirely in the  $a$ 's,  $b$ 's or the  $c$ 's.

Say that  $vxy$  occurs entirely in the  $a$ 's. Then  $s_0$  will contain fewer of  $a$ 's than  $b$ 's or  $c$ 's.

Thus  $s_0$  is not in  $L$ .

The case where  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $b$ 's or  $c$ 's is handled similarly.

Case 2:  $vxy$  occurs within the  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's.

Say that  $vxy$  occurs within the  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's. Then  $s_0$  will contain  $n$   $c$ 's, but either fewer than  $n$   $a$ 's and fewer than  $n$   $b$ 's. Thus  $s_0$  is not in  $L$ .

Case 3:  $vxy$  occurs within the  $b$ 's and  $c$ 's.

This case is handled similar to case 2.

It has been shown that there is no way to divide  $s$  into  $uvxyz$  so the pumping lemma holds. Thus, the pumping lemma does not hold for  $L$ , and  $L$  must not have been context-free.

2. Use the pumping lemma to prove that the following is not context free.

$$L = \{a^n b^m c^k : m > n, n > k \text{ and } m, n, k \geq 0\}.$$

Claim  $L$  is not context-free.

Proof: Suppose, by way of contradiction, that  $L$  is context-free. Then the pumping lemma must hold for  $L$ . Let  $p$  be the pumping length. Consider the string  $s = a^p b^{p+1} c^{p-1}$ . Clearly  $s \in L$  and  $|s| \geq p$ . The pumping lemma guarantees that  $s$  can be divided into five pieces  $s = uvxyz$  where  $|vxy| \leq p$ ,  $|vy| > 0$  and  $s_i = uv^i xy^i z \in L$  for all  $i \geq 0$ .

Consider all possible breakdowns  $s = uvxyz$  where  $|vxy| \leq p$ ,  $|vy| > 0$ .

Case 1:  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $a$ 's.

Case 2:  $vxy$  includes both  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's.

Case 3:  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $b$ 's.

Case 4:  $vxy$  includes both  $b$ 's and  $c$ 's.

Case 5:  $vxy$  lies entirely in  $c$ 's.

Consider each case separately.

Case 1:  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $a$ 's.

If  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $a$ 's, pump up to get a string which has the same or more  $a$ 's than  $b$ 's. That is,  $s_2 = a^{p+|vy|} b^{p+1} c^{p-1}$ . Since  $|vy| > 0$ , there are too many  $a$ 's, and  $s_2 \notin L$ .

Case 2:  $vxy$  includes both  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's.

Case 2a.  $v$  or  $y$  includes both  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's.

If  $v$  or  $y$  include both  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's, pump up, to get  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's interleaved.

That is, if  $v = a^r b^s$ , then  $s_2 = a^p b^s a^r b^{p+1+s} c^{p-1}$ , which is not in  $L$ . Similarly, if  $y$  includes both  $a$ 's and  $b$ ',  $y = a^r b^s$ ,  $s_2 = a^p b^s a^r b^{p+1+s} c^{p-1}$  which isn't in  $L$ .

Case 2b. Neither  $v$ , nor  $y$ , includes both  $a$ 's and  $b$ 's.

In this case  $v$  must lie entirely in the  $a$ 's and  $y$  must lie in the  $b$ 's. If  $|v| > 0$ , pump down so there are no longer fewer  $c$ 's than  $a$ 's ( $s_0 = a^{p-|v|} b^w c^{p-1}$ ). If  $|v| = 0$ , then  $|y| > 0$ , pump down, reducing the number of  $b$ 's, so there are no longer more  $b$ 's than  $a$ 's ( $s_0 = a^p b^{p+1-|y|} c^{p-1}$ ).

Case 3:  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $b$ 's.

If  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $b$ 's, pump down to get a string which has the same or more  $a$ 's than  $b$ 's. That is,  $s_0 = a^p b^{p+1-|vy|} c^{p-1}$ . Since  $|vy| > 0$ , there are too many  $b$ 's, and  $s_0 \notin L$ .

Case 4:  $vxy$  includes both  $b$ 's and  $c$ 's.

Case 4a.  $v$  or  $y$  includes both  $b$ 's and  $c$ 's.

Similar to Case 2a, if  $v$  or  $y$  include both  $b$ 's and  $c$ 's, pumping up will cause the  $b$ 's and  $c$ 's to be interleaved, so  $s_2 \notin L$ .

Case 4b. Neither  $v$ , nor  $y$ , includes both  $b$ 's and  $c$ 's.

In this case  $v$  must lie entirely in the  $b$ 's and  $y$  must lie in the  $c$ 's. If  $|v| > 0$ , pump down so there are no more  $b$ 's than  $a$ 's ( $s_0 = a^p b^{p+1-|v|} c^w \notin L$ ). If  $|v| = 0$ , then  $|y| > 0$ , pump up increasing the number of  $c$ 's, so there are no longer fewer  $c$ 's than  $a$ 's ( $s_2 = a^p b w^l c^{p-1+|vy|} \notin L$ ).

Case 5:  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $c$ 's.

If  $vxy$  lies entirely in the  $c$ 's, pump up to get a string which has the same or more  $c$ 's than  $a$ 's. That is,  $s_2 = a^p b^{p+1} c^{p-1+|vy|} \notin L$ .

Thus there are no decompositions  $s = uvxyz$  that allow the string  $s$  to be pumped. Thus, the pumping lemma does not hold for  $L$ , and  $L$  must not have been context-free.